SEL Program Comparison Matrix

	Caring School Community	The Incredible Years	MindUP	Positive Action	Promoting Alternative THinking Strategies (PATHS)	RULER Approach	Second Step Elementary	Social Skills Improvement System (SSIS) Classroom Intervention Program	Student Success Skills	Tools of the Mind	Lions Quest: Skills for Growing	Conscious Discipline
Age range	K-8	Ages 0-12	PreK-8	PreK-12	PreK-5	PreK-12	K-5	PreK-8	PreK-12	PreK-K	PreK-5	PreK-5
Evidence of efficacy range	Grades 3-6	PreK	Grades 4-7	Grades 1-5	PreK and grades 1-3	PreK and 5-6	K-5	Grade 1 - 2	Grades 4-5 and 7-8	PreK - K	Grades 1 - 4	PreK
Number of US studies	2	5	2	13	10	4	14	4	23	14	1	5
Studies that work with low income students	One with a socioeconomically diverse group	One with 69% of families being low income	One with 72% of students being low income	7 worked with low income students	6 worked with low income students	Two worked with schools with up to 94% low income students	8 worked with low income students	One with 69.9% of students coming from low income families	A significant portion of studies worked with low income students	9 worked with low income students	One with 68-75% low income students	One with 69% of families being low income
Cost	Kit is $200 per classroom, no subscription, optional professional learning	Single online training is $775, $6,850 for a workshop, $1,520 for one set of curriculum, large puppets are about $450 each, small are about $30, ongoing consultation, videos through online yearly subscription	Yearly subscription, individual membership is $120, 30 memberships + training is $2,500, train the trainer is $1,500	Kit is $400-450 per classroom, up to 15% discount for buying in bulk, additional specialized kits are $20-500, refresher kits are $150 each	Kindergarden kit is $889, first grade kit is $679, others are about $500, refresher kits are about $150	$6,000-$8,000 for first two years, $1,000 subscription fee afterward	About $459 for each classroom implementation kit, can buy consumable or extra elements separately	$140-189 a year per classroom, PIP costs $900 a year; for assessments PIP is $1,800 and SSIS SEL is $2,100 a year, plus $500 for mental health scales	About $100 manual per classroom, optional training	About $3,500 per classroom for apps and data analysis plus $600 classroom kit, subscription fee	$2,700 to do a one day workshop, about $100-$200 per teacher for 5 years access to online content	Free resources, site liscence is $779-$5,500 depending on the number of users
Teaching Methods	Didactic instruction and discussion	Music and visual displays	Discussion and didactic instruction	Discussion and visual display	Discussion and didactic instruction	Discussion and visual display	Discussion and visual display	Discussion and SEL tools	Discussion and didactic instruction	Discussion and visual display	Discussion and visual display	Songs and virtual displays
Approach with disengaged students	Consider issues in teaching practices	Pull out program	Treat with tier 1	Celebrate accomplishments of students who are struggling	Provide tools for adapting lessons for tiers 2 and 3	Pay attention to emotions of disengaged students to learn how to engage them	Treat with tier 1	Treat with tier 1	Make it personal and emphasize that learning SEL skills is in student's best interest	Study buddy groups have students keep each other from disengagement	Address different learning styles, not much	Smaller group interventions, one-on-one connections
International work	Just US	Used in more than 20 countries, including Australia	Used in 12 countries, including Australia	International	International, including Australia	International, including Australia	Used in 12 countries, including Australia	International, including Australia	Used in 14 countries	International	Used in over 100 countries, including Australia	Used in over 47 countries, including Australia
Training style	In-person or virtual workshops, not required	Self-Training before implementation, then onsite training by certified trainer, TCM has Train the Trainer	Initial live session with followup asynchronous training 2-4 sessions throughout the year, Train the Trainer option	No required training, offers a recommended orientation training, can be online or onsite	Two online training modules before implementing , follow-up training available after 3 months of implementation	Train-the-Trainer, at least 3 participants from the school must complete the RULER Institute at Yale or the RULER Institute Online, one must be the school leader	Individual online training prior to implementing, offers a Leadership Institute for district-wide implementation	Relies on self-training, recommends reviewing the SSIS SEL CIP Manual, offers online training webinars and training briefs	No required training, optional training available	Require one year of Core Training	In-person or Zoom workshops	10-session self-paced online course, multi-day professional development (available over Zoom), on-site events
Training time	2 days in person or half day virtual	3 days onsite training after self-training, online option	90 minute live session, followup sessions are often 90 minutes	3-4 hours online or 1-2 days onsite	Two 3-hour modules	2 days at Yale or 6 weeks online	1 hour online training Leadership Institute is two days in June, followed by monthly meetings	N/A	N/A	Five full days of workshops over the course of the year	Two days in person, half day over Zoom	Self-paced, 10 sessions
Lesson time per week	20-30 min/day	2-3 lessons/week, 20-30 min/lesson	40 min/lesson over the course of 2-3 weeks	4 lessons/week, 15 min/lesson	2-3 lessons/week, at least 30 min/lesson	18 units per grade, two 45-minute lessons per week	22-25 weeks; 1 lesson and 4 follow-through activities/week; 20-45 min/lesson and 5-10 min/follow-through activity	90 lessons in 30 units 3 lessons/week 20-30 min/lesson	Five sessions 45 minutes long Spaced a week apart	70 PreK and 87 K activities delivered through the day, every day, throughout the year	1 lesson/week, 30/40 minutes/lesson	Integrated with the rest of the day
Rating for the NCESE	★★☆☆	★☆☆☆	★★★★	★★★☆	★★★☆	★★★★	★★★☆	★★☆☆	★★★☆	★☆☆☆	★☆☆☆	★★☆☆

All data from Number of US studies, Studies that work with low income students, and Teaching Methods comes from the study Navigating SEL from the Inside Out, with the exception of Student Success Skills, which is not included in the study. Data from Age range and Evidence of efficacy range comes from the CASEL SEL program guide. All other data comes from program websites or our personal interviews.